1. The Senate assembled at thirty minutes past Two O’clock.

2. The Proceedings were opened with Prayer said by the Deputy Speaker.

3. COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CHAIR

The Deputy Speaker conveyed the following communications from the Chair:

(i) Visiting Members of Parliament and staff from the Zanzibar House of Representatives

“Honourable Senators,

I would like to acknowledge the presence, in the Speaker’s Gallery this afternoon, of visiting Members of Parliament and staff from the Zanzibar House of Representatives.

I request each member of the delegation to stand when called out so that they may be acknowledged in the Senate tradition.

They are:-

1. Hon. Mgeni Hassan Juma - Deputy Speaker
2. Hon. Shehe Hamad Mattar - Chairman of the House
3. Hon. Haroun Ali Suleiman - Minister of State, President’s Office, Constitution, Justice, Public Service and Good Governance

4. Hon. Dr. Khalid Mohammed - Minister of Finance and Planning
5. Hon. Panya Ali Abdalla - Member of Steering Committee
6. Hon. Mohamed Said - Member of Steering Committee
7. Hon. Rashid Makame Shamsi - Member of Steering Committee
8. Hon. Miraji Khamis Musa - Member of Steering Committee
9. Hon. Ali Salum Haji - Member of Steering Committee
10. Hon. Machano Othman Said - Member of Steering Committee
11. Mr. Mussa Kombo Bakari - Chief Legal Counsel and Head of House Business
12. Mr. Khamis Mohammed Salum - Head of Department of Sub Office
13. Mr. Ramadhan Khamis Masoud - Standing Committees Coordinator

In our usual tradition of receiving and welcoming visitors to Parliament, I extend a warm welcome to them and, on behalf of the Senate and on my own behalf, wish them a fruitful visit.

I thank you.”

(ii) Visiting officers from the Namibia National Assembly

“Honourable Senators,

I would like to acknowledge the presence, in the Speaker’s Gallery this afternoon, of visiting Staff from the Namibia National Assembly.

I request each officer to stand when called out so that they may be acknowledged in the Senate tradition.

They are:

1. Mr. John Shimaneni - Director, Information and Communication
2. Ms. Leseina Lamek - Senior Administrative Officer
3. Mr. Ian Van Wyk - Administrative Officer
4. Mr. Vincent Sinalumbu - Administrative Officer
5. Ms. Sophia Shivolo - Administrative Officer
6. Ms. Paulina Dumeni - System Administrator

In our usual tradition of receiving and welcoming visitors to Parliament, I extend a warm welcome to them and, on behalf of the Senate and on my own behalf, wish them a fruitful visit.

I thank you.”

(iii) Status of Statements at the end of the Session

“Honourable Senators,

You may recall that at the end of the last Session, Statements that were pending before Committees lapsed. Indeed, that was the practice during the last Parliament.

Honourable Senators,

As you are also aware, on the 9th of August, 2018, this House amended its Standing Orders relating to the manner of processing Statements as provided for in standing orders 46 to 53. In a nutshell, the Committee, which a statement has been sought from, may invite the Senator who requested the Statement, the
relevant Cabinet Secretary or any other person it may consider necessary during deliberations on the Statement and may prepare and table a report on the matter. Once the report is tabled, the Speaker may allow comments or observations in relation to the report.

Honourable Senators,

This calls for a change in how statements are handled at the end of the Session. You may also be aware that Petitions, although they have timelines within which they should be reported back to the House, they do not lapse at the end of the Session. This is to allow Committees to finalize any Petitions that are before them.

Honourable Senators,

Statements now form part of the core business of the Committees and borrowing from the practice of dealing with Petitions at the end of the Session and given the new provisions of the Standing Orders on Statements, I hereby wish to guide that statements that are referred to Committees shall not lapse at the end of every Session as has been the practice. Referral of a statement to a committee is a delegation of duty which must be done to the logical conclusion and in a timely manner so that the House does not act in vain.

I thank you.”

(iv) Scope of application of Standing Order No. 1 of the Senate Standing Orders

“Honourable Senators,

As you will recall during yesterday’s deliberations on the interim report by the chair of the Standing Committee on Health on Universal Health Care and the Managed Equipment Services (MES) program, a question arose on the scope and extent of application of Standing Order No. 1. Owing to the fact that it is a matter that is raised in the House from time to time, the Chair undertook to issue guidance to elaborate on the principle and purpose of the Standing Order and its application.

For the benefit of the House, Standing Order No. 1 (1) and (2) states as follows-

“(1) In all cases where matters are not expressly provided for by these Standing orders or by other Orders of the Senate, any procedural question shall be decided by the Speaker.

(2) The decisions made in paragraph (1) shall be based on the Constitution of Kenya, statute law and the usages, forms, precedents, customs, procedures and traditions of the Parliament of Kenya and other jurisdictions to the extent that these are applicable to Kenya.”
Honourable Senators,

The quoted Standing Order is very important and it is at the core of the performance of our constitutional and statutory duties as a Senate and it is no wonder that it is a standard or common feature in Standing Orders of many jurisdictions especially in the Commonwealth. Its essence of being is to provide a legitimate procedural window not only for the convenience of the House and interest of justice but also to ensure that the supervening responsibility of the Senate as a House of Parliament is not handicapped or constrained by its own rules. In other words, it is intended to unshackle the House from processes that are not alive to unforeseen circumstances or realities. The net effect is to ensure that the House does not become a prisoner or captive of its own rules. Indeed, it is a safety valve providing an escape route for the Senate from a mechanical application of detailed rules in the Standing Orders to accomplish its mandate or greater good.

It is my considered view that there is a hierarchy of norms of Standing Orders whereby Standing Order No. 1 empowers the Senate to wriggle out of specific Standing Orders for the purpose of ensuring that the greater or fundamental objective of justice, representation of the will of the people and other aspirations are achieved even if there could be other Standing Orders that either provide or inadequately allow such application. It is hence no wonder that the Standing Order appears at the beginning rather than at the end.

Honourable Senators,

The generic application or main thrust of the Standing Order is to cater for matters ‘not expressly provided for by these Standing Orders or by other Orders of the Senate.’

There are however, several elements that we deduce from the foregoing text, as follows-

a) First, there is recognition that the Standing Orders have not provided for everything;

b) Secondly, the gaps require supplementing by other orders of the Senate, which is, among others, routinely undertaken through sessional orders as well as practices that we have developed over the years; and,

c) Thirdly, there are matters that are provided for in the Standing Orders but are not “express” and hence in want of clarification.

Honourable Senators,

Arising from the foregoing, the Standing Order in question therefore places a heavy responsibility on the Speaker who has to decide “any procedural question.”
Its exercise hence calls for patience and retrospection due to its significance in the performance of the role of the Senate and the precedent setting nature of the determination. Consequently, by tradition, once the Speaker makes a determination, it is binding. In the unlikely event that you disagree with the decision, the practice is for you to move the Chair to review it akin to review of a judgment by a court or overturn of a judgment by superior court upon appeal.

Speaker therefore expects full co-operation from Senators as the Standing Order is applied judiciously noting its far-reaching consequences not only on enhancing confidence in the office of Speaker but more importantly, on the efficient and effective performance of functions bestowed on the institution of Senate in exercise of sovereign power delegated by the people of Kenya.

I thank you.”

(v) **Guidance on Scope of Matters Concerning Counties**

Honourable Senators, I have the following communication to make –

Honourable Senators, at the sitting of the Senate on 5th December, 2018, Senator Mutula Kilonzo Junior rose on a point of order seeking the Speaker’s guidance and ruling on Senate’s consideration of matters concerning counties.

Honourable Senators, Article 123 of the Constitution deals with decisions of the Senate. Of importance is Article 123(2) which requires that, when the Senate is to vote on any matter other than a Bill, the Speaker shall rule on whether the matter affects or does not affect counties.

Further, standing order 79 of the Senate Standing Orders provides on voting on a matter other than a Bill. The Standing order provides that when the Senate is to vote on any matter other than a Bill, the Speaker shall rule on whether the matter affects or does not affect counties. The Speaker’s ruling shall be made after conclusion of debate on the matter but before the question is put.

This matter has been canvassed by various Speakers of the Senate of Kenya who have restated the provisions as provided for in the Constitution and the Senate Standing Orders. There is however need to clarify and flag out the salient ingredients of what constitutes matters concerning counties.

Honourable Senators, I must note that I concur with established precedence so far by the Senate of Kenya. However, the issue of what constitutes matters concerning counties is much broader in my view. In any case, having listened to deliberations by Honourable Senators during the sitting of the Senate held on 5th December, 2018, there is a desire that the issue be considered broadly over and above Article 123(2) of the Constitution.
The issue of what constitutes a matter that affects or does not affect counties in my opinion there are at least eleven instances that would qualify as matters affecting counties. Accordingly, a matter affects or does not affect counties if its determination –

(a) has implications on any of the functions that constitute the exclusive jurisdiction of county governments as provided for under Part 2 of the Fourth Schedule to the Constitution as read together with Article 186(1) of the Constitution;

(b) has implications on any of the functions that constitute the concurrent jurisdiction of the national and county governments as stipulated in the Fourth Schedule to the Constitution generally as read together with Article 186(2) of the Constitution;

(c) has implications on any function that comprises the exclusive jurisdiction of the national government in accordance with Article 186(1) and Part I of the Fourth Schedule to the Constitution provided that such a matter has some connection of any kind whatsoever with counties and their governments.

(d) has implications on any of the functions that fall under the residual functions of the national governments in accordance with Article 186(3) of the Constitution provided that the matter in question is relevant or has a bearing on the operations and connections to counties and their governments;

(e) has implications on the workings and operations of the County Executive of any County including the ancillary structures such as the County Public Service Board; or if the matter has implications on the operations of the County Assemblies and any structures ancillary to the Assemblies such as the County Assembly Service Board;

(f) has implications on the Senate as a House of Parliament while discharging its shared parliamentary functions with the National Assembly under Article 94 of the Constitution and in particular in relation to Article 94(1) regarding the exercise of legislative authority on behalf of the people of Kenya; Article 94(2) when representing the will of the people; and exercising the sovereignty of the people of Kenya; and Article 94(4) while the Senate is protecting the Constitution and protecting the democratic governance of the Republic;

(g) has implications on the Senate while the Senate is exercising its exclusive role and mandate under Articles 96(1), (2) and (4) of the Constitution;
(h) has implications or connections with the Senate while the Senate is exercising its delegated sovereign power of the people under Article 1(2) of the Constitution as democratically elected representatives of the people;

(i) if the matter concerns or affects the operations or internal workings of the Senate as an institution that protects counties and their governments;

(j) if the matter affects in any way, one or more counties; or

(k) any matter affecting Nairobi County by virtue of the county doubling as the capital of Kenya and a County; it is therefore a county *sui generis* making such a matter as a matter affecting all counties of the Republic of Kenya;

Honourable Senators, the above criteria should be applied in determining whether a matter affects or does affect counties pursuant to Article 123 of the Constitution excluding Bills. Regarding *Bills concerning county governments* under article 110 of the Constitution, the Supreme Court in Advisory Opinion Reference No. 2 of 2013 provided a very broad definition of Bills concerning county governments and that the definition “creates room for the Senate to participate in the passing of Bills in the exclusive functional areas of the national government, for as long as it can be shown that such Bills have provisions affecting the functional areas of the county governments”.

Further, the Supreme Court held that “the Senate should be able to find something that affects the functions of the counties in almost every Bill that comes to Parliament, making it a Bill that must be considered and passed by both Houses”.

Honourable Senators, I take note with a lot of interest that the Supreme Court of Kenya in considering the Advisory Opinion Reference No. 2 of 2013 recited its decision in an earlier matter before the Court *Re: the Matter of the Interim Independent Electoral Commission, Supreme Court Const. Appl. No. 2 of 2011—*

“We consider that the expression ‘any matters touching on county governments’ should be so interpreted as to incorporate any national-level process bearing a significant impact on the conduct of county government …”.

Honourable Senators, this opinion relates to the provisions of Article 123 of the Constitution only. The provisions of Article 110 require separate treatment and the Speaker should at the appropriate time give guidance on the same. We note the Supreme Court advisory on the matter where the court observed that –

“With a good Speaker, the Senate should be able to find something that affects the functions of the counties in almost every bill that comes to Parliament, making it a bill that must be considered and passed by both Houses.”
Honourable Senators, I encourage all Senators to, in future, appropriately move the Speaker whenever it is necessary to provide guidance and clarification on these matters affecting counties, bills affecting counties among others.

I so rule.”

4. **PETITION**

Pursuant to Standing Order 230(2)(a), the Senator for Kitui County (Sen. Enoch Wambua) presented to the Senate a Petition by residents of Kitui County concerning non-payment by the County Government of Kitui of pending bills incurred during the Financial Year 2015/2016.

Pursuant to Standing Order 231, the Deputy Speaker invited Senators to comment on the Petition and, subsequently, committed it to the Standing Committee on Finance and Budget, pursuant to Standing Order 232(1).

5. **PAPERS LAID**

The following Papers were laid on the Table of the Senate: -

(i) Report of the 139th Assembly of the Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) and related meetings held in Geneva, Switzerland from 14th -18th October 2018.

*(Sen. Susan Kihika, MP)*

(ii) Report of the Delegation to Mauritius to attend the 2nd Annual Conference of the Institute of Certified Public Secretaries (ICS).

*(Sen. Rose Nyamunga, MP)*


*(Sen. (CPA) Farhiya Ali, MP)*

(iv) Statement on the Business of the Senate for the week commencing Tuesday, 12th February, 2019.

*(The Senate Deputy Majority Leader)*

(v) Interim report on the policy and implementation of the Universal Health Care (UHC) in the counties.

*(Chairperson, Standing Committee on Health)*

6. **NOTICE OF MOTION** – (Sen. Susan Kihika, MP)

THAT, AWARE THAT, learners with special needs and disabilities in Kenya experience many challenges in accessing affordable, and inclusive education;
COGNIZANT THAT, Article 54(1)(b) of the Constitution stipulates that a person with any disability is entitled to access educational institutions and facilities for persons with disabilities that are integrated into society to the extent compatible with the interests of the person;

MINDFUL THAT, Article 24 (2) of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) states that parties shall ensure that persons with disabilities are not excluded from the general education system on the basis of disability, and that children with disabilities are not excluded from free and compulsory primary education, or from secondary education, on the basis of disability;

UNDERSTANDING THAT, challenges to obtain an education are even bigger to children with disabilities as they struggle to not only to get a quality education, but to gain access to educational facilities as the cost of commuting to and from school is high, while the cost of boarding schools remains one of the greatest barriers;

NOTING THAT, the distance to and from school can be prohibitive, and the cost of using public transport is often beyond the means of many families, coupled with concerns over the safety of children with disabilities travelling alone to school;

CONCERNED THAT, poor physical environment of most schools combined with the teachers having little knowledge of disability issues, results in many disabled children not attending school at all, and those who are enrolled in school are far more likely than their nondisabled peers to drop out mainly due to the fact that disabled children do not receive the amount and type of attention that they need in order to be able to successfully complete their education;

NOW THEREFORE, the Senate resolves to compel the Ministry of Education in collaboration with the National Treasury and stakeholders to implement the National Special Needs Education Policy framework, and the Education Sector Policy for Learners and Trainees with Disabilities within the scope of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) with an aim of:

a. developing a blueprint to ensure adequate resource allocation and infrastructural planning, expansion and implementation for the provision of free, quality inclusive education and accommodation for children with disabilities in mainstream schools, that can be replicated in all 47 counties;

b. employing more technical disability-related staff such as sign language interpreters, physiotherapists and braille transcribers to provide support in and out of the classroom to learners with disabilities;

c. developing curricula to train and empower teachers and school staff to cope with the specific needs for learners with disability who are boarders; and,
d. creating community led peer to peer groups such as parent associations, father to father groups, and child to child clubs with the aim of breaking down misconceptions and myths surrounding disability issues, and reversing the associated stigma.

7. **NOTICE OF MOTION** – (Sen.(CPA) Farhiya Ali, MP)

   THAT, this House notes the Report of the Commonwealth Women Parliamentarians (CWP) East Africa Sub Region Sensitization Workshop.

8. **NOTICE OF MOTION** – (Sen. Falhada Imana, MP)

   THAT, AWARE THAT Article 29 of the Constitution guarantees every person the right to freedom and security, including the right not to be subjected to any form of violence or torture,

   AND AWARE THAT, Article 43 guarantees every person economic and social rights such as the right to the highest attainable standards of health, including the right to health care services, and reproductive health care;

   FURTHER AWARE that, the country has enacted various legislative and policy measures to address sexual and gender-based violence, including the Sexual Offences Act, No. 3 of 2006, the Children’s Act, No. 8 of 2001, the Protection Against Domestic Violence Act, No. 2 of 2015, and the National Health Sector Standard Operating Procedures on the Management of Sexual Violence in Kenya of 2014;

   COGNIZANT THAT, in addition to various pieces of legislation Kenya has ratified and domesticated various conventions, treaties and other international instruments addressing sexual and gender based violence;

   CONCERNED THAT, despite the existence of an extensive legal framework, many of the victims of sexual and gender based violence do not report these cases, leading to a low conviction rate and lack of co-ordination between health facilities and other agencies involved in mitigating sexual and gender based violence;

   DEEPLY CONCERNED THAT, there are no designated care units in public health facilities to deal with sexual and gender based violence victims;

   NOTING THAT, sexual and gender based violence is mostly perpetrated against women of all ages and across the social strata impacting their self respect, dignity, privacy and health, and resulting in unwanted pregnancies, unsafe abortion, sexually transmitted infections, genital injuries, infertility, pelvic inflammatory diseases and even loss of life;

   FURTHER NOTING THAT with appropriate medical attention, the undesirable consequences of sexual and gender-based violence can be mitigated in addition to assisting in collection and preservation of evidence for purposes of prosecuting the perpetrators;

   NOW THEREFORE the Senate calls upon the Ministry of Health, in collaboration with the county governments, to:
1. establish and adequately equip sexual and gender-based violence care units in all public health facilities;
2. provide treatment and counseling services to victims of sexual and gender-based violence free of charge in all public health facilities;
3. put in place co-ordination mechanisms between health facilities and other agencies involved in addressing sexual and gender-based violence.

9. **NOTICE OF MOTION** – (Sen. Susan Kihika, MP)

   THAT, this House notes the Report of the 139th Assembly of the Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) and related meetings held in Geneva, Switzerland from 14th-18th October 2018 laid on the Table of the Senate on Thursday 6th December, 2018.

10. **NOTICE OF MOTION** – (Sen. Rose Nyamunga, MP)

    THAT, this House notes the Report of the Delegation to Mauritius to attend the 2nd Annual Conference of the Institute of Certified Public Secretaries (ICS).

11. **STATEMENTS**

    **(i) Statement pursuant to Standing Order No. 48(1)**

    a) Nominated Senator (Sen. Mary Seneta) on behalf of Nominated Senator (Sen. Sen. Judith Pareno) sought a statement from the Standing Committee on Energy on vandalism of electricity transformers serving schools and community projects in Kajiado County.

    b) Nominated Senator (Sen. Mary Seneta) on behalf of Nominated Senator (Sen. Sen. Judith Pareno) sought a statement from the Standing Committee on Roads and Transportation on the status of Kajiado-Mashuuru-Isara Road in Kajiado County.

    c) The Senator for Turkana County (Sen. Imana Malachy Ekal) sought a statement from the Standing Committee on National Security, Defence and Foreign Relations on the invasion and take-over of a Constituency Development Fund, National Government Project, namely the Kapetadiye dam, by pastoralists from a neighbouring country.

    d) The Senator for Turkana County (Sen. Imana Malachy Ekal) sought a statement from the Standing Committee on National Security, Defence and Foreign Relations on the raid and stealing of livestock by suspected bandits in Kaakongu, Turkana County.

    e) The Senator for Bungoma County (Sen. Moses Wetangüla) sought a statement from the Standing Committee on Roads and Transportation regarding the transfer of the management and operations of the Jomo Kenyatta International Airport to the Kenya Airways Limited.
(ii) **Statements pursuant to Standing Order No. 51(1)(b)**

The Chairperson, Standing Committee on Health issued a statement on the Universal Healthcare (UHC) Programme and tabled an interim report in response to a Statement sought by the Senator for Isiolo County (Sen. Fatuma Dullo) on policy and implementation of Universal Health Care in Counties.

(iii) **Statement Pursuant to Standing Order No. 52(1)**

The Senate Deputy Majority Leader issued a statement regarding the business of the Senate for the week commencing Tuesday, 12th December, 2019.

12. **THE COUNTY GOVERNMENTS RETIREMENT SCHEME BILL (NATIONAL ASSEMBLY BILLS NO. 10 OF 2018)**

Order for Second Reading read;

Motion made and Question proposed-

THAT, the County Governments Retirement Scheme Bill (National Assembly Bills No. 10 of 2018) be now read a Second Time.

*(The Senate Majority Leader – 29.11.2018)*

Debate interrupted on Wednesday, 5th December, 2018;

Order deferred.

13. **MOTION – THE FIDUCIARY RISK REPORT OF THE SESSIONAL COMMITTEE ON COUNTY PUBLIC ACCOUNTS AND INVESTMENTS**

(Chairperson, Sessional Committee on County Public Accounts and Investments)

THAT, this House adopts the Report of the Sessional Committee on County Public Accounts and Investments on Fiduciary Risk regarding issues raised by the Auditor General on public financial management by County Governments for Financial Years 2013/14 – 2015/16, laid on the Table of the House on Wednesday, 14th November, 2018.

Order deferred.

14. **MOTION – REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE AND BUDGET ON THE COUNTY GOVERNMENTS’ INFRASTRUCTURE PROJECTS**

(Chairperson, Standing Committee on Finance and Budget)

THAT, this House adopts the Report of the Standing Committee on Finance and Budget on the County Governments’ infrastructure projects comprising County Executive Headquarter offices, Assembly Chambers and offices and County State officers’ residences, laid on the Table of the Senate on Thursday, 29th November, 2018.

Order deferred.

(Sen. Susan Kihika, MP)

THAT, this House notes the Report of the 138th Assembly of the Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) and related meetings held in Geneva, Switzerland from 22nd - 28th March, 2018 laid on the Table of the Senate on Thursday, 21st June, 2018.

Order deferred.


(Sen. Fredrick Outa, MP)


Order deferred.

17. **MOTION – REPORT OF THE SENATE DELEGATION TO THE 39TH ANNUAL FORUM OF PARLIAMENTARIANS FOR GLOBAL ACTION**

(Sen. Mutula Kilonzo Jnr., MP)

THAT, the Senate notes the Report of the Kenya delegation to the 39th Annual Forum of Parliamentarians for Global Action laid on the Table of the House on Thursday 11.10.2018.

Order deferred.


(Sen. Abshiro Halake, MP)

THAT, this House notes the Report of the 62nd Session of the Commission on the Status of Women laid on the Table of the House on Tuesday, 17th July, 2018.

Order deferred.

19. **MOTION- ADJOURNMENT OF THE SENATE**

Motion made and Question proposed:
THURSDAY, DECEMBER 06, 2018

THAT, pursuant to Standing Orders 28 and 29, the Senate do adjourn until Tuesday, 12th February, 2019.

(The Deputy Senate Majority Leader)

Debate arising;

And the time being thirty minutes past Six O’clock, the Temporary Speaker (Sen. Rose Nyamunga) interrupted the proceedings and adjourned the Senate without Question put, pursuant to the Standing Orders.

20. **SENATE ROSE** – at thirty minutes past Six O’clock.

**MEMORANDUM**

The Speaker will take the Chair on Tuesday, February 12, 2019 at 2.30 p.m.

--X--